

# JP e3s Sub-Programme 2: Just Transition and Governance of the Energy Transition



Coordinated by  
Manfred Paier (AIT) & Ramazan Sari (DTU)

Helsinki, 24 May 2023

# Session Agenda

- ▶ **SP2 in perspective: Review of the work plan (SRIA)**

Manfred Paier (AIT)

- ▶ **Presentation of the White Paper “The Just Energy Transition in the EU”**

Ganna Gladkykh (EERA)

- ▶ **Discussion**

The graphic features a dark blue hexagon containing the text 'SP2' in white. To its right, the word 'Mission' is written in white on a light green background. Below this, a large blue shape resembling a stylized arrow or a large letter 'A' points downwards, containing the mission text in dark grey. The background is a light green color with a white geometric shape at the top right.

**SP2**

## **Mission**

To identify and address the necessary changes in the **governance** structures of the energy system at all levels to **make the Energy Transition a participatory and inclusive process** able to meet the climate change targets, jointly with the **empowerment of citizens and vulnerable groups** and the satisfaction of the energy needs for all.

# Background and challenges of the Energy Transition (ET)

- ▶ **The political choice for decarbonisation and decentralisation of the energy sector is linked to cross-sector conflicts and tensions**
  - ▶ **Energy system actors:** producers, infrastructure operators, service providers, end users including industry
  - ▶ **Transformation stakeholders:** policymakers, public administration, researchers, civil society organisations, interest groups, citizens
- ▶ **Behavioural change of end-users is not sufficient for breaking out of the fossil fuel regime**
  - ▶ Fundamental change of **legal, economic and social frameworks** needed
  - ▶ For the Energy Transition to occur in a democratic system, it must be a **just transition**
- ▶ **The change in governance must go in the direction of the three pillars of the just transition**
  - ▶ **Distributional justice:** equity in the distribution costs and benefits of the ET
  - ▶ **Procedural justice:** right of all citizens to participate in decision-making
  - ▶ **Recognition justice:** recognising vulnerable groups and how they are affected by the previous two

## Areas of intervention of SP2 ...

- ▶ **Multi-level governance and regulatory frameworks for the ET**
- ▶ **Transformative governance of the ET**
- ▶ **Democratisation of the energy system, securing engagement and empowerment of people**
- ▶ **Energy justice, equity and social inclusion**

## ... and corresponding objectives

- ▶ **To provide a comprehensive characterization of the (multi-level) governance structure of energy system**
  - ▶ EU, national, local
  - ▶ Role of power relations among energy system stakeholder groups
- ▶ **To provide guidance for the governance of the transition process**
  - ▶ Identifying and addressing the regulatory gaps that hamper the ET
  - ▶ Supporting the policy coordination at EU and member states level
- ▶ **To identify effective engagement strategies for actual empowerment of citizens**
  - ▶ In terms of awareness and participation
- ▶ **To identify and measure social impacts of ET**
  - ▶ Paying specific attention to the definition and measurement of energy poverty
  - ▶ Developing countermeasures and subsistent provision of energy services for all in the face of crises

# Contribution to e3s Mission / relation with other networks

## ▶ **E3s Mission**

- ▶ Deeper understanding of the gaps that might hamper a smooth and just ET
- ▶ Conceptual tools and evidence on the social impacts of ET pathways and diverse governance settings

## ▶ **Linkages within JP e3s ...**

- ▶ SP3, on the social dimension of sustainability
- ▶ SP4, concerning the fairness of the different market and business models
- ▶ SP5, as regards the diverse institutional contexts where to frame the transition pathways.

## ▶ **... and outside JP e3s**

- ▶ All the other EERA JPs, particularly with JP DfE as far as the SSH perspective on the digitalization of the ET is concerned

# Current and future activities (facts and options)

- ▶ **White Paper on “The Just Energy Transition in the EU”**
  - ▶ Ganna’s presentation
- ▶ **Collecting information on relevant activities conducted by e3s partners**
  - ▶ Research, policy advice
  - ▶ Accomplished, ongoing, planned
- ▶ ...



2

# EERA White Paper on the Just Energy Transition in the EU

Ganna Gladkykh, EERA Secretariat

# Structure of the paper

## 1. Introduction - The Just Energy Transition (JET) in Europe

## 2. Challenges towards achieving a JET in Europe

### 2.1 Distributional Justice

### 2.2 Procedural Justice

### 2.3 Recognition Justice

## 3. Current EU policies addressing JET

### 3.1. The recent JET policy context in the EU

### 3.2. EU-level policies analysis through the lens of the Energy Justice pillars

### 3.3. Role of energy communities in Europe in reducing energy poverty

### 3.4. National-level policies in Europe as a response to the current energy crisis

## 4. Policy Recommendations

### 4.1. Overarching policy recommendations to achieve JET

### 4.2. Policy recommendations related to the procedural justice pillar

### 4.3. Policy recommendations related to the distributional justice pillar

### 4.4. Policy recommendations related to the recognition justice pillar

# Main messages

- **The clean energy transition** has the potential (if not suitably addressed by equitable policies) to **maintain or even deepen socioeconomic inequalities**. Therefore, a comprehensive and fair clean energy transition strategy is crucial.
- **Energy justice scholarship can serve as a guiding framework** to add to the coherence and consistency of the European policy
- A categorization under the **three energy justice pillars can support generating effective policies** to guide the clean energy transition towards fairer energy systems, ensuring that no relevant aspects of the just energy transition are overlooked

# JET definition & the 3 pillars

The **just transition is defined as “a fair and equitable process of moving towards a post-carbon society”** ([McCauley and Heffron, 2018](#)).

<p><b><i>1. Distributional justice</i></b></p> <p>concerns equity in the distribution of goods in a given society or group and is tied to the concept of <i>substantative equality</i> (Pellegrini-Masini et al., 2020a).</p>	<p><b><i>2. Procedural justice</i></b></p> <p>regards to the right of all citizens to participate in an open and inclusive process of decision-making, and it tied to the concept of <i>formal equality</i> (Pellegrini-Masini et al., 2020b).</p>	<p><b><i>3. Recognition justice</i></b></p> <p>includes calls to acknowledge the <i>divergent perspectives</i> rooted in social, cultural, ethnic, racial and gender differences (Jenkins et al., 2016)</p>
---	--	---

# Operationalizing energy justice pillars for policy analysis: criteria for policy analysis

<i>1. Distributional justice</i>	<i>2. Procedural justice</i>	<i>3. Recognition justice</i>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• <b>Inequality gap</b> increase driven by the energy transition</li><li>• Impacts on <b>job loss</b></li><li>• <b>Access to clean energy infrastructure</b></li><li>• Access to <b>financial resources</b> and incentives</li><li>• <b>Intergenerational aspect</b> of clean energy investment</li><li>• <b>Global justice</b> aspects</li><li>• <b>Infrastructure ownership</b></li><li>• Access to <b>energy efficiency</b> increase measures</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• <b>Citizens' involvement</b> in policy design and implementation</li><li>• Participatory aspects focused on <b>social acceptance</b> of a technology but also <b>beyond social acceptance</b> of a technology</li><li>• Participation <b>obstacles for vulnerable groups</b></li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Acknowledging <b>vulnerable actors and groups</b></li><li>• Considering <b>policy impact on vulnerable</b> actors and groups</li><li>• Addressing <b>social and economic impacts</b> connected to energy poverty</li></ul>

# The EU policy analysis through the energy justice pillars: Distributional pillar example

Objective/scheme	IEM Directives (until 2019)	EU Green Deal - JTM (2021)	Fit for 55 package - SCF (parts 1 and 2)	REPowerEU (2022)	Energy Communities directive (2018-19)	EED- 2012 amended (2018)
<b>1. Distributional justice pillar</b>						
1.1. Prevent inequality gap increase driven by the energy transition	Indirect mention	Adequately considered	Well addressed	General mention	General mention	Indirect mention
1.2 Considering impacts of the clean energy transition on job loss	Insufficiently considered	Well addressed	Adequately considered	General mention	Indirect mention	Indirect mention
1.3 Considering equal access to clean energy infrastructure	Indirect mention	General mention	Adequately considered	General mention	Adequately considered	Adequately considered
1.4 Considering adequate access to financial resources and incentives	Indirect mention	Indirect mention	Adequately considered	Adequately considered	Indirect mention	Indirect mention
1.5 Acknowledging intergenerational aspect of clean energy investment (e.g. public debt)	Insufficiently considered	Indirect mention	Indirect mention	Indirect mention	Indirect mention	Insufficiently considered
1.6. Addressing global justice aspects of the clean energy transition (e.g. materials supply)	Insufficiently considered	Well addressed	Well addressed	Insufficiently considered	Indirect mention	Insufficiently considered
1.7. Considering aspects of ownership of the renewable energy infrastructure	Insufficiently considered	Insufficiently considered	Indirect mention	Indirect mention	Adequately considered	Insufficiently considered
1.8. Considering aspects of access to energy efficiency measures	Indirect mention	General mention	Well addressed	Adequately considered	Adequately considered	Well addressed

# The EU policy analysis through the energy justice pillars: Findings












- While the **recognition justice pillar** receives overall adequate attention in the EU legislation reviewed, **the procedural and especially the distributional pillar** are much less addressed.

Why? Acknowledging the right of vulnerable groups to participate in the energy transition (recognition pillar) is often easier than considering assets and funding opportunities (distributional pillar) or defining inclusive processes of participation (procedural pillar).

- **Energy communities** deserve a separate **discussion in the context of energy justice policies** and especially **energy poverty**. For its capacity to empower end-consumers, energy communities can be considered a strategic niche for social innovation and for achieving the goals of the JET.

# National level policies – how EU Member States respond to the energy crisis?

- **Energy-crisis response** measures vs short-term and long-term impact on the JET in Europe.
- **The disruption of the energy markets** triggered by Russia's invasion of Ukraine made energy in the EU Member States less affordable.
- **Subsidising fossil fuel consumption** (including that to support energy poor) is a measure commonly present in Europe's energy crisis mitigation toolkit. This hinders the clean energy transition progress.

	Subsidies, fixed payments or tax reductions for energy bills <b>low-income and vulnerable</b> households and/or <b>businesses</b>
	<b>Income tax</b> reduction/ Min salary increase
	<b>Buildings</b> retrofitting measures
	Measures encouraging energy <b>demand reduction</b>
	Measures supporting shift to <b>electrified or renewable heating</b>
	Measures supporting <b>enrolment of renewables</b>
	Measures supporting <b>extension of nuclear energy (lifetime and/or new projects)</b>
	Electricity <b>VAT reduction</b> or exemption
	<b>Freezing or capping</b> electricity and/or gas tariffs
	<b>Fossil fuel</b> subsidies
	<b>Other</b> measures



# Policy recommendations

- The recommendations include the overarching recommendations as well as those **structured around procedural, distributional and recognition energy justice pillars**. The basic assumption is that incorporating the energy justice framework in the regulatory and legal frameworks in Europe could help achieve a just transition holistically.

# Overarching policy recommendations to achieve JET:

- Incorporate **JET frameworks in all stages** of the clean energy transition planning and implementation
- Adopt **reliable metrics** and measures for monitoring JET progress in Europe
- Support **energy literacy** at all levels
- The scope of the JET should go **beyond the energy sector only**

# Policy recommendations: Distributional Justice

- Extend distributional justice principles to the **global supply and value chains** necessary for energy transition in Europe
- Enable **community ownership of energy infrastructures** with policy and regulatory frameworks
- Design **austerity measures** considering the distributional justice aspects

# Policy recommendations: Procedural justice

- Shift the policy and the initiatives' implementation focus **from the technology acceptance to the holistic implementation** of the procedural justice principles
- **Empower affected citizens** and other stakeholders to shape the just transition agendas
- **Include the voices of multiple stakeholders** in the European just energy transition discussions
- Design and implement participatory tools that **acknowledge vulnerable groups' needs**

# Policy recommendations: Recognition justice

- Take an intersectional approach to **address multiple issues** connected to energy poverty and energy vulnerability
- **Support social innovation** within the energy transition to leave “no one behind”
- Prioritize the recognition justice principles when implementing the **skills agenda** for the clean energy transition

# White Paper Dissemination

## Groningen conference in June:

Second International Conference  
on New Pathways for a Just and  
Inclusive Energy Transition:  
Connecting Multiple Stakeholders  
and Levels

From: Tu 20-06-2023  
Until: We 21-06-2023  
Where: University of Groningen, the Netherlands



## European Week of Regions and Cities in October:

Applications are closed

Partners have been selected

[Read more](#)



21<sup>st</sup>

European Week of  
Regions and Cities

Thriving Regions, Stronger Europe

#EURegionsWeek

9-12  
October  
2023



**Comments are  
welcome!**



**Thank you**

[www.eera-set.eu](http://www.eera-set.eu)

manfred.paier@ait.ac.at

